## Contents

#### Preface 9

#### Chapter 1 – Introduction 13

- 1.1 The aims of this study 15
- 1.2 Co-management as a central focus 16
- 1.3 The structure of the analysis 17
  - 1.3.1 Political perspective 18
  - 1.3.2 Ideational perspective 18
  - 1.3.3 Institutional/organisational perspective 19
  - 1.3.4 Socio-economic perspective 19

#### Chapter 2 – Reflections on the method 23

- 2.1 My research background and interests 23
- 2.2 The 20 selected publications 25
- 2.3 Research strategy 26
- 2.4 Examples of data-collection methods used in the 20 selected publications 28
  - 2.4.1 In-depth and focus groups interviewing 28
  - 2.4.2 Participant observations 29
  - 2.4.3 Quantitative methods 30
  - 2.4.4 Literature reviews and official documents 30

#### Chapter 3 – An introduction to the Danish and EU fisheries systems 33

- 3.1 The natural system 35
  - 3.1.1 The fish stocks 35
  - 3.1.2 The eco-system 42
- 3.2 The socio-economic system developments in the Danish fisheries sector 45
  - 3.2.1 The fisheries sector 45
  - 3.2.2 Fisheries communities 50
- 3.3 The governance system 51
  - 3.3.1 The Common Fisheries Policy 51
  - 3.3.2 Fisheries management: The TAC approach 53
  - 3.3.3 National decision-making within the CFP: the case of Denmark 55
  - 3.3.4 Alternative fisheries management: the adaptive indicator approach 56

# Chapter 4 – The political dynamics of EU decision-making and national implementation of the CFP 59

- 4.1 The CFP is a political system in crisis 60
  - 4.1.1 Marginal impact of reforms 61
  - 4.1.2 Fragmented structure of interests 63
  - 4.1.3 The problem of implementation drift 65
- 4.2 Towards an explanation of the political deadlock in CFP policy-making 70
  - 4.2.1 Three illustrative examples 72
  - 4.2.2 Politics of implementation 84

#### Chapter 5 – Fisheries co-management 89

- 5.1 What is co-management? 91
- 5.2 New modes of governance in the EU 92
- 5.3 Co-management ideas and their practical implementation 98
- 5.4 User and stakeholder involvement in fisheries co-management 100
- 5.5 The scale of co-management institutions 103
  - 5.5.1 An example of scale: the shallow water shrimp fishery in Sofala Bay 104
- 5.6 Who should be represented in co-management? 105
  - 5.6.1 Problems of co-management in relation to the CFP 107
  - 5.6.2 The fragmented interest structure within fisheries organisations 110
  - 5.6.3 User aspiration and capabilities needed for co-management 114
- 5.7 Co-management and power: conflicts about property rights 117
- 5.8 The relationship between co-management and legitimacy 120
- 5.9 A note on the concept of "Reversing the Burden of Proof" as co-management 124

#### Chapter 6 - Non-cooperative games:

#### A mismatch between rules and practices 127

- 6.1 Systemic irrationality 128
- 6.2 Regulations versus fishing practices 129
- 6.3 Fisheries management, fiscal and financial policies, and fishing communities 138
- 6.4 Is adaptive fisheries management an alternative? 142
  - 6.4.1 Some practical experience with adaptive indicator-based management 144

#### Chapter 7 – Summing up and assessing the prospects for policy change 147

- 7.1 Prominent characteristics of the fisheries policy systems in the EU and Denmark 147
  - 7.1.1 Resource characteristics 148
  - 7.1.2 Characteristics of the economic structure of the European fishing sector 149

- 7.1.3 Political characteristics 149
- 7.1.4 Management regime characteristics 149
- 7.1.5 Regime change characteristics 150
- 7.2 General and overall features of the CFP 151
- 7.3 Assessing the prospects for policy change 152
  - 7.3.1 Removal of structural aid 153
  - 7.3.2 Paradigm shift in the management of demersal fisheries 154
  - 7.3.3 Regionalisation of the CFP 155
  - 7.3.4 Devolution of management responsibilities 156
  - 7.3.5 Market-based approaches 157
  - 7.3.6 Final remarks 158

References 161

List of Acronyms 171

Annex 1 – Articles and book chapters forming the base of the book 173

### Preface

This book is the synthesis report of my senior doctoral thesis and represents the culmination of 15 years of my research. It draws on material generated through participation in nine large research projects, a number of advisory assignments and supervision of five PhD students. The senior doctoral thesis was submitted to Aalborg University in August 2008 for assessment for the Doctor of Science degree. The assessment committee was composed of Professor Per Christensen, Aalborg University, Denmark (chairman), Professor Susan Hanna, Oregon State University, USA and Professor Bjørn Hersoug, University of Tromsø, Norway. The thesis was successfully defended on 12 May 2009 in the North Sea Science Park in Hirtshals.

The book provides an analysis of the problems that the EU and the Danish fisheries management systems are facing. In order to provide some contrast to the EU situation experience from fisheries management systems in Southern African countries and Vietnam is included. By pointing to important explanatory factors for the failure of the Common Fisheries Policy, I hope that the book will be useful to those involved in fisheries management in the EU, Denmark, and other countries as well. I have to emphasise that the material presented in the book relates to the period before July 2008, and therefore the book does not directly address the issues raised in the *Green Paper - Reform of the Common Fisheries Policy* presented by the Commission in April 2009. Nevertheless, it is my hope that the book will make a valuable contribution in the process of reforming the Common Fisheries Policy as it uses four different perspectives: political, ideational, institutional/organisational and socio-economic to explain the failures of the Common Fisheries Policy.

Over the years I have been in contact with a large number of people in the fisheries sector and fishing communities in Denmark, Europe, southern Africa and Vietnam, as well as politicians and officials in fisheries administrations in the same countries. Without their willingness to discuss, and at times argue with me, it would have been impossible to conduct the research that has enabled me to write this book. I express my sincere gratitude to all of you for taking the time to share your knowledge with me and inspire my research.

I would also like to express my thanks to all the research collaborators from the various research projects in which I have participated, and in particular to those with whom I have co-authored the publications on which this book is based. Our discussions have been extremely rewarding, and I have learnt a lot from you. It is always risky to mention some and not others, but Tomas Vedsmand, Mafaniso Hara and Troels Jacob Hegland, with whom I have co-authored more than half of the 20 publications, deserve to be mentioned by name. Mafa, you also deserve warm thanks not only from me, but also from my family for your kind assistance during our stay in Cape Town in 2004-2005, making it a very memorable experience.

Without support from my employers it would have been impossible to write this book. In this respect it was fortunate that IFM decided to set-up a sabbatical research arrangement, otherwise I would not have had the courage to embark on this project. Therefore, big thanks are due to Sten Sverdrup-Jensen, as well as the IFM Board of Trustees for making this decision. Poul Degnbol has been very supportive and an intellectual stimulation when I began implementing my sabbatical, and Eskild Holm Nielsen "protected" me during the period when I was completing the book. Thanks for your support, encouragement and commitment. The North Sea Centre has been very supportive to IFM and to me over the years, and I particularly express my gratitude to its former director, Poul Pedersen.

To all the colleagues I have worked with at IFM: Sten, Valdimar, Sevaly, Vibeke, Anne Katrine, Tomas, Jesper, Kirsten, Ninna, Dorte, Christoph, Ingvild, Poul, Jan, Doug, Torben, Thomas O., Anne-Sofie, Alyne, Thomas A., Troels, Søren, Ana, Ditte, and Rikke – thanks for making IFM an extremely interesting and motivating research environment, and for your active participation in fruitful discussions that have enabled us to formulate the research proposals on which this book is based.

This book has benefited from the contributions of a number of people, and I will in particular mention Hilary Palevsky, Troels Jacob Hegland, Mafaniso Hara and Sten Sverdrup-Jensen to whom I am thankful for providing comments on chapters 3, 4, 5 and 7, respectively. Sincere thanks also to Mette Bertelsen for assisting me in compiling the biological data used in section 3.1. Kirsten Klitkou has been an invaluable support. She has been involved in all aspects of the editing process, as well as the proofreading. Kirsten deserves all the credit for turning my text files into a professional manuscript. I am deeply grateful to her for all the effort she has invested in putting this book together. I have been very fortunate that Edward Lahiff accepted my request to undertake the English language editing. I am very grateful to him for turning my "Danglish" into fluent and easily readable English, but he has done more than that – he has pointed to weaknesses in my arguments and my sympathetic treatment of fisheries and fisheries management in EU and Denmark, which required further explanation to be understandable to an outsider.

I would also like to express my gratitude to Jørn Munk Nielsen for his support over the years and in particular his assistance in providing generous financial support through the "Initiative Foundation" for the municipality of Hirtshals, which enabled me to engage an academic coach during the process of writing this book. My former PhD supervisor Staffan Zetterholm, who had recently retired, agreed to take on the role of coach, and it has been a big privilege for me to re-establish collaboration with him. The collaboration has been a wonderful experience, and I am extremely grateful to him for all his support and thoughtful suggestions for improving the structure of the book and the logic of the arguments. Like Edward, Staffan, being a non-fish person, has asked for explanation and clarification of issues which I considered basic knowledge, making me realise that the fisheries management universe is complex and complicated and requires a thorough introduction to the problems and arguments presented in this book.

Looking back, it has been a privilege to undertake research on a fascinating subject which also happens to be my hobby. It has provided me with the opportunity to travel around the world and visit many interesting places, be exposed to other cultures and meet many inspirational people. Now, however, I believe my time is up on this project. My children have often asked me: "Dad, when will you be done with your book?" followed by the remark "You are always working in your office, we want to do things together like other families." I know I have been "absent", and plans with friends and in particular my family have been postponed or adjusted according to my research schedule (even summer holidays have been in fishing areas, enabling me to collect data). Thank you Simon, Sarah and Nancy for your patience and understanding – and to Nancy, thank you for your consistent support during all the years. Without your support I would never have been able to complete this book project. Also thanks to the rest of the family and my closest friends for being understanding and flexible when making arrangements with us.

Just to clarify, I am not planning to retire yet and I have many exciting academic and professional challenges ahead of me, which I look forward to with great pleasure. However, for many years now I have been generating a large social deficit, and the balance between work and my social life will change in the future.

Jesper Raakjær Hirtshals, October 2009